DEAR SIR, — I consider it a great honor to have been asked by the American Oriental Society to record my opinion of Professor Whitney's services, in the field of Indian Philology especially, and I will try to comply with their request.

It was first as a translator of Whitney's famous work on Language and its Study that I became fully acquainted with the depth and research of his writings, though indeed I had been using a great deal the Atharva-Veda as edited by Professors Roth and Whitney, "rothena ca hvinneyena ca čodhita," when I was reading the Veda with Professor Weber at Berlin as a student. The late lamented Professor Georg Curtius of Leipzig having directed my attention to the advisability of rendering Whitney's Language and its Study accessible to the general reader in Germany through the medium of a German translation and adaptation, I lost no time in undertaking that task, and derived much pleasure and profit from the close acquaintance which I formed, in the course of my labors, with the eminent work of Professor Whitney. While my translation was going through the press, he sent me several valuable contributions to my work, as well as the first volume of his delightful Oriental and Linguistic Studies, which I reviewed for a German scientific periodical. Among the many remarkable essays collected in that volume, which includes Whitney's attractive essay on the Vedic Doctrine of a Future Life and a number of valuable reviews and criticisms, the short but masterly essay on the Avesta has always appeared to me a specially striking instance of Whitney's rare skill in exhibiting in a condensed shape the salient features of an entire department of philological research. The first series of Whitney's Oriental and Linguistic Studies was speedily succeeded by the second, which is as rich in constructive essays as the first is in critical ones, and contains among other valuable papers Whitney's instructive and able remarks on the history of the Nakṣatras in India. Indian
astronomy had always been a favorite subject with Professor Whitney, and he had published as early as 1860 his commentary and notes on the Sūrya-Siddhānta. Dr. James Burgess has well brought out in his Notes on Hindu Astronomy the value and interest of that work, when he says that it is a model of careful annotation and has placed within the reach of all who are interested in the subject a complete outline of Hindu methods of astronomical calculation, together with a clear exposition of the theories on which they are based, and their relations to European science.

In descending from the Vedas, his first love, to the Vedāṅgas, Professor Whitney took up another important branch of Hindu science besides astronomy. This was the science of phonetics, which is so ably discussed in the Prātiṣṭhākhyas, two of which were edited and translated by Whitney in 1862 and 1871. His successful labors in that field may have served him as a preparation for his Sanskrit Grammar, his principal work, towards which all his various studies and labors may be said to have converged. His edition of the Atharva-Veda, with which he had introduced himself so successfully as a Sanskrit scholar, his Prātiṣṭhākhyas, his contributions to the Sanskrit Dictionary jointly edited by Boehtlingk-Roth, his labors in the field of linguistic science, these and his other achievements must have caused him to appear the fittest person to be entrusted with the difficult and responsible task of approaching the Sanskrit language from a new point of view, and writing a Sanskrit Grammar for the well-known Library of Indo-European Grammars. I remember well the enthusiasm with which his engagement to do so was greeted by Sanskrit scholars in Germany, myself among the number. It was in 1875, and I had just then repeatedly met Whitney both in Germany and England, my veneration for the man and scholar having been enhanced, I need hardly say, by personal acquaintance. He set to work with his wonted energy and produced after four years' work the well-known lucid and elaborate volume, which has fully realized the expectations entertained of it, and materially aided the progress of Sanskrit and linguistic studies. One of the principal new features of Whitney's Sanskrit Grammar, the
utilization of the ample materials to be gained from an independent examination of Sanskrit literature for the study of grammar, comes out even more strongly in the supplement which he added to his grammar a few years later, as may indeed be gathered from the list of Sanskrit works consulted in the course of preparing his "Roots." The solidity and trustworthiness of the materials underlying his researches in the field of Indian grammar and lexicography may be tested by his exhaustive Index Verborum to the Atharva-Veda, which he printed in 1881.

One important part of Whitney's services in the field of Indian philology, his merits and achievements as a teacher of Sanskrit, and as a member of the American Oriental Society, can be sufficiently appreciated only by his pupils and junior colleagues in America. However, we Germans have been eagerly reading his numerous minor papers, and we cannot fail to see the results of his teaching and example in the fact that he has found so much talent to join and help him in his studies and in the rapid and unprecedented rise of Sanskrit studies in America. Germany may well feel proud to have assisted in training a scholar like Professor Whitney, in whom learning and industry, powerful logic and indefatigable perseverance was coupled in a remarkable manner with originality and genius.

Apologizing for my bad English, I have the honor to sign myself, Sir.

Yours with respect and esteem,

J. JOLLY.